Finance, austerity and inequality: towards gender equitable alternatives

Diane Perrons Gender Institute, London School of Economics

TASC and FEPS The Challenge of Inequality to Recovery and Wellbeing Dublin 2014

Finance, austerity and inequality: towards gender equitable alternatives

- Rising inequality and gender inequality
- Austerity Policies in the UK rationale and gendered impact
- Alternative understanding of the economy for more inclusive, gender equitable societies

Rising inequality and growing concern



Pope Francis 2014 : inequality – 'the root of social evil' Barack Obama (2013): 'the defining challenge of our

'the defining challenge of our time.'

Christine Lagarde: 'the 85 richest people in the world,...., control as much wealth as the poorest half of the global population that is 3.5 billion people and this casts a 'dark shadow across the global economy.' Lagarde (2014) Thomas Piketty's Capital in the 21st Century – US best seller

Source: Cassidy (2014) from Piketty (2014) Available at: http://www.newyorker.com/online/blogs/johncassidy/2014/03/piketty-looks-at-inequality-in-six-charts.html

Rising inequality – enduring gender equality





World Bank 2012

Institutional interest – but resolutions largely depend on greater integration with the market economy – rather than recognising that the market reproduces gender inequalities The only sustainable way to reduce inequality is to **stop** the underlying widening of wages (OECD 2008;116)

But existing theories – cannot account satisfactorily for rising wage inequality and the persistence of the gender pay gap

Reference is being made to social norms - (Krugman 2002) Managers ability to appropriate high returns (Piketty 2014)

More work on wage determination.

For discussion related to the EU follow button

Gender segregation and 'market' values

care work –

'market' misrecognition and undervaluation

finance – 'market' misrecognition and overvaluation



'prisoners of love' (Folbre 2008)

UK finance executive of a failed bank was retained to advise on its restructuring on a **monthly** salary 3* the **annual** salary of a childcare worker with 20 years of experience. (Perrons and Plomien 2013)

'masters of the universe'

high incomes 'can just as easily reflect market imperfections rather than proof of social value

...too much of the developed world's intellectual talent was devoted to ever more complex financial innovations, whose maximum possible benefit in terms of allocative efficiency was at best marginal'

(Adair Turner 2009:5 Chair of the FSA)

'we're all in this together' Cameron (2009)



Source: Matt Buck 2010

income group as % of net income decile 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 -5% -5% -10% -10% -15% -25% -25% -30% -35%

Effects of spending cuts by

Source: Reed cited by WBG (2010)

Phase 2: UK: class differentiated impact of public expenditure cuts

- higher impact on low income groups in which women are over represented

'we're all in this together' Cameron (2009)



family type without couple with children colldren pensioner # flat-rate (Innual) other service-related -4% transport housing. -8% social care -10% education IIIE/FE/skills) 12% education (schools) ⊆ 14% a -16% 5 -18% Source: Reed cited by WBG (2010)

Source. Matt Buck 2010

Phase 2: UK: family differentiated impact of public expenditure cuts

- higher impact on family groups in which women are over represented

Effects of spending cuts by family type

'we're all in this together' Cameron (2009)



UK Gender Wage Gap

Phase 2: UK: Indications of a rising gender wage gap with Coalition Government post 2010 (own calculations from ONS 2014a)

'*we're all in this together*' Cameron (2009)



2014 – for doers makers and savers

Rhetoric –stigmatises people with legitimate welfare claims

UK 2014 Budget

Tax Give Aways– mainly to male advantage

raising the personal tax allowance transferable tax system reduced duty on beer and classic cars Expenditure Cuts – disproportionately falling on women as employees as service users

Source: WBG (2014)

'we're all in this together' Cameron (2009)



Coalition – focus on austerity to secure deficit and debt reduction Presumes reduction is necessary Presumes it can be secured through austerity Evidence not very convincing





• no evidence for a particular level of government debt or deficit 'always an alternative macro economic strategy that is economically feasible; but different strategies imply different distributions of the costs and benefits' (Loxley 1997 cited by Elson and Cagatay 2000)

Fiscal space – political choice not a technical necessity Foreign borrowin

IMF Fiscal space is 'room in a government's budget that allows it to provide resources for a desired purpose without jeopardizing the sustainability of its financial position or the state of the economy' (IMF cited by UNDP 2007)



• UNDP Fiscal space is the financing that is available to government as a result of concrete policy actions for enhancing resource mobilization, and the reforms

necessary to secure the enabling governance, institutional and economic environment for these policy actions to be effective, **for a specified set of development objectives.** (UNDP 2007:i).

Fiscal space – political choice not a technical necessity Foreign borrowi

IMF Fiscal space is 'room in a government's budget that allows it to provide resources for a desired purpose without jeopardizing the sustainability of its financial position or the state of the economy' (IMF cited by UNDP 2007)



• UNDP Fiscal space is the financing that is available to government as a result of concrete policy actions for enhancing resource mobilization, and the reforms

necessary to secure the enabling governance, institutional and economic environment for these policy actions to be effective, **for a specified set of development objectives.** (UNDP 2007:i). Fiscal space is the available financing, designated by policy choices, to provide the necessary resources for a **specific set of social, economic, and environmental objectives, taking into account the specific needs of marginalized groups using race, gender and class impact analysis' (Ida 2013 – a Fem Econ Student LSE)**

Alternative capitalisms/solutions to inequality

- Chrstine Lagarde Inclusive Capitalism an oxymoron or an antidote to Marx's dire prediction – that capitalism contains the seeds of its own destruction ?
- Thomas Piketty Global wealth tax
- Ex poste redistribution rather than challenging the processes generating inequality
- Heterodox economists forms of Keynesianism advocate increased Government expenditure – physical infrastructure

WBG -Feminist F Plan for Recovery

Recognises the significance of the reproductive sector



- Invest in social rather than just physical infrastructure –
- (including better pay for skills of care workers)

- Spending on childcare simultaneously generates jobs and facilitates movement into employment, partially paying for itself through increased tax revenues.
- There is now evidence for these claims



WBG – UK Women's Budget Group http://www.wbg.org.uk/

Conclusion: a more inclusive alternative

- **EX ante** wage revaluations redress the fall in the share of value added accruing to labour by increasing wages of the low paid reducing wage differentials
- Ex Poste progressive taxation wealth tax and Tobin or Maid Marion tax on financial transactions – to be used for investment in infrastructure social and physical
 - by valuing care differently and widening the understanding of the economy to include the reproductive sector represents one way of moving towards a more inclusive and sustainable society in which both inequality and gendered inequality would be lower – and potentially growth higher
- Keynes in a global and gendered context

Thank YOU

Economic Value of Social Care

- Direct economic value £20-billion p.a.- 1.8% of all GVA and provides jobs for 6.4% of workforce in England (1.3 FTE jobs 1.5 million people)
- Indirect effects £16 billion 1.1 m jobs purchases of goods and services of suppliers
- Induced effects £ 6.4 billion and 0.5 million jobs and the impact of the wages spent –
- Overall 2.8 million jobs and £43 billion GVA
- These do not include the less tangible impact such as reduced health costs or the effects of well being
- Effects favourable when compared to other sectors (ICF GHK 2013)

EU research under Framework 6 : INEQ

EU research under Framework 6 : INEQ - Shows that Economic Policies are leading to increased Inequality in the EU

Summarized in Why Socio-Economic Inequalities Increase ?

Policies to combat poverty and social exclusion

But - Social Policies subordinated to Economic Priorities

Failure to recognise that: economic processes are redistributive as well as wealth creating and social policies can be productive as well as a cost

Member states and individual households left to resolve these tensions between the market and society.

But without the means to do so.

Source: Perrons and Plomien 2010

http://ec.europa.eu/research/socia sciences/pdf/policy-reviewinequalities en.pdf



Why socio-economic inequalities increase? Facts and policy requests in Every

References

- Cameron, D. (2009) Speech to the Conservative party Conference. Available at: <u>http://www.theguardian.com/politics/2009/oct/08/david-cameron-speech-in-full</u>
- Elson, D. (1998) The economic, the political and the domestic: Businesses, states and households in the organisation of production, New Political Economy, 3 (2): 189-208
- Elson, D. and N. Catagay (2000). "The Social Content of Macroeconomics Policies," World Development, 28, 7 (July), pp. 1347-1364.
- Eurostat (2014) Graph calculated from Unadjusted Gender Pay gap Tables and GraphicsAvailable at: http://epp.eurostat.ec.europa.eu/tgm/table.do?tab=table&plugin=0&language=en&pcode=tsdsc340
- Folbre, N. (2008) Valuing children rethinking the economics of the family. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press.
- ICF GHK (2013) The Economic Value of the Adult Social Care Sector in England, London: Skills for Care Available at: <u>http://cdn.basw.co.uk/upload/basw_114055-9.pdf</u>
- Ida, K (2013) LSE Feminist Economics Course Student Blog Contribution.
- Krugman, P (2002) For Richer, New York Times, October 20th
- http://www.pkarchive.org/economy/ForRicher.html (accessed March 2009)
- Lagarde, C. (2014) Economic Inclusion and Financial Integrity—an Address to the Conference on Inclusive Capitalism, London May 27th. Available at: <u>http://www.imf.org/external/np/speeches/2014/052714.htm</u>
- Obama, B. (2013) Remarks by the President on Economic Mobility, The White House Office of the Press Secretary Available at: <u>http://www.whitehouse.gov/the-press-office/2013/12/04/remarks-president-economic-mobility</u>
- OECD (2008) Growing Unequal. Income Distribution and Poverty in OECD Countries <u>http://ocde.p4.siteinternet.com/publications/doifiles/812008051P1G018.xls</u>
- ONS (2014a) Gender Wage Gap data taken from ASHE Earnings Survey Table 1.6a from various years Available at: <u>http://www.ons.gov.uk/ons/datasets-and-tables/index.html</u>
- OND (2014b) UK debt and deficit, Available at: http://www.ons.gov.uk/ons/rel/psa/eu-government-debt-and-deficit-returns/march-2014/stb---march-2014.html

References continued

- Perrons, D and Plomien, A. (2013) Gender, inequality and the crisis: towards more equitable development In: Karamessini, Maria and Rubery, Jill, (eds.) Women and Austerity: the Economic Crisis and the Future for Gender Equality. Routledge IAFFE advances in feminist economics. Abingdon: Routledge
- Piketty, T. (2014) Capital in the Twenty-First Century, Cambridge, MA, Harvard University Press.
- Pope Francis (2014) Inequality is the root of social evil Tweet- reprinted in Winfield (2014) Available at: http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2014/05/09/pope-francis-redistribution-wealth- n 5294629.html
- Turner, A. (2009) 'The Financial Crisis and the Future of Financial Regulation', Speech by Adair Turner, Chair, FSA, The Economist's Inaugural City Lecture, 21 January 2009. Available at: <u>http://www.fsa.gov.uk/library/communication/speeches/2009/0121_at.shtml</u>
- UNDP (2007) Fiscal space for what? Analytical issues from a human development perspective. Available at: http://www.undp.org/content/dam/aplaws/publication/en/publications/poverty-reduction/poverty-website/fiscal-space-for-what/FiscalSpaceforWhat.pdf
- World Bank (2012) Gender Equality and Development Report, Available at: <u>http://econ.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/EXTDEC/EXTRESEARCH/EXTWDRS/EXTWDR2012/0,,contentMDK:22999750~menuPK:8154981~pagePK</u> :64167689~piPK:64167673~theSitePK:7778063,00.html
- WBG (2010) The Impact on Women of the Coalition Spending Review 2010 UK Women's Budget Group November 2010 Available at: http://www.wbg.org.uk/RRB_Reports_4_1653541019.pdf
- WBG (2014) Uk Women's Budget Group for further information and documents for various years see http://www.wbg.org.uk/